



FULL HISTORIC REVIEW

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

DATE: June 16, 2026

ACTIVITY NUMBER: SD-0226-00030
RELATED ACTIVITY NUMBERS: TC-RES-1225-05979
LOCATION: 217 E 17TH STREET(PARCEL #117071590)
ZONING: HR-3
HISTORIC ZONE/DISTRICT: ARMORY PARK HPZ
APPLICANT: GUSTAVO SILVA
PROJECT NAME: ADU
STAFF CONTACT: MICHAEL TAKU, LEAD PLANNER

PROPOSED PROJECT

The proposed project is a 405 SF Accessory Dwelling Unit (ADU). It will have a maximum ridge of 13' with a decorative parapet with single-sloped Galvanized metal roof. Will be built with insulated concrete foam blocks clad in sand-floated plaster in an un-pigmented white Portland cement with natural sand. A new 6'-0" corrugated metal fencing is proposed on the north property line, and along the eastern alley side, a 6'-0" wall constructed of mikey block and clad in lime plaster—matching the materials of the ADU—will extend 24'-0" south from the north property line to a gated entry. Proposed demolition of a rear addition and restoration of the rear porch. Restored rear porch to feature a wood door with three horizontal recessed panels and glass pane at the top, a 6" x 6" rounded porch post, a wooden floor atop a concrete base and wood over concrete steps. A new fascia board to match existing, as well as roof and eaves to match existing. The original brick walls on the North and East sides (enclosed by addition) to be preserved.

PROPERTY DESCRIPTION

The lot is 0.06 acres (2,707 sq. ft), and the existing historic house is a contributing historic building, built circa 1904. The historic house is a one-story with brick exterior and stone veneer along the foundation. It has a low hip, offset gable roof with composite shingles, a chimney and slatted vent with 2 square lites. The eaves are projected with plan fascia and soffit. The windows are double hung 1/1. A non-contributing detached accessory building used for storage is located at the rear of the parcel. A 5' chain-link fence borders front and both side property lines

APPLICABLE PRESERVATION STANDARDS

Pursuant to provisions of Section 5.8.9 of the City of Tucson Unified Development Code (UDC), the proposed project was reviewed for compliance with historic preservation standards by the Historic Preservation Office

City of Tucson Planning and Development Services Department
201 North Stone Avenue | P.O. Box 27210, Tucson, AZ 85726-7210
Telephone: (520) 791-5550 | E-mail: PDSHistoric@tucsonaz.gov
Website: www.tucsonaz.gov/PDSD

(HPO), the Armory Park Zone Advisory Board. Applicable preservation standards include:

- Section 5.8 of the City of Tucson Unified Development Code (UDC)
- Technical Standards Manual Section 9-02
- The Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation
- Armory Park Zone Design Guidelines

HISTORIC ZONE ADVISORY BOARD COMMENTS

On March 17, 2026, AHPZ Meeting, recommendation for a continuance with the following comments:

- Explore what historic fabric remains at the rear addition of the existing home to provide the basis for the board to make a recommendation for the demolition of a contributing element of a contributing structure
- Provide more information regarding the proposed replacement of the demolished rear addition, new fence, and proposed setbacks

On April 21, 2026 APHZAB recommended denial of the project based on incorrect, non-measured elevations, incomplete information on the restoration of what appears to be a fairly original screen porch, information on the window replacements on the contributing structure that have already been made, and to accommodate or redesign functional services on the ADU and possibly consider window changes that would be more compatible with window projection and recession forms in Armory Park.

On May 14, 2026, the TPCHC, PRS recommend approval of the project as presented with the following conditions: (1) New porch windows to be aluminum-clad wood; (2) The ADU should be shifted to the west so that the east setback is no less than the existing house, and that a 4’ setback on the west side would be acceptable; (3) The 2’ setback on the north is acceptable; (4) New wood and glass lite door on north elevation to match the existing front door; and (5) All new mechanical equipment to be screened from view from the street.

PUBLIC/NEIGHBORHOOD INPUT

The Department has not received any public comments regarding the proposed project.

ZONING & BUILDING CODE REQUIREMENTS

This review applies only to the project’s compliance with historic preservation standards. Compliance with all other applicable zoning and building code regulations is required to obtain a building permit. Changes made to the plan to achieve compliance with these other code requirements may require another review for compliance with historic preservation standards.

STAFF FINDINGS

Historic Preservation staff find that the proposed work will conform with applicable preservation standards:

| |
|---|
| <p>Contributing Property Modifications & Additions (UDC 5.8, TSM 9-02.7.0, SOI Standards, HPZ Design Guidelines)</p> |
|---|

S D NA

S - satisfies D - does not satisfy NA - not applicable

(1) **Minimal Exterior Changes**

Exterior alterations and changes are minimal; property to be used as it was historically or given new use that requires minimal change to distinctive materials, features, spaces, and spatial relationships

(2) **Visibility**

Alterations or renovations visible from the street are minimal

(3) **Height**

Height generally conforms to typical height within development zone; new additions are no higher than the tallest contributor of the same use in the development zone (e.g. principal buildings are compared to principal buildings, accessory structures are compared to accessory structures except for Accessory Dwelling Units, which are compared to primary buildings); and height of new buildings are compatible with the height of neighboring contributing historic properties.

(4) **Roof Types**

New or replaced roof is compatible in configuration, mass, and materials to that of the existing structure

(5) **Setbacks**

Maintains prevailing street and interior perimeter yard setbacks within its development zone

- (6) **Site Utilization**
Spacing between buildings is consistent with that of contributors within the development zone
- (7) **Building Form**
Size, scale and mass of additions are compatible with existing structure and with contributors in development zone
- (8) **Proportion**
Changes are consistent with proportions of existing structure and with prevailing proportions of contributing properties within development zone
- (9) **Projections and Recessions**
Appropriate to the style of the existing structure
- (10) **Rhythm**
Proportion, patterns and rhythm of openings, including at additions, are compatible with those of existing structure and those of contributors within development zone
- (11) **Windows & Doors**
The size, shape, and materials of window and door openings are maintained; repair options fully explored before replacement is considered; removals/infills are limited to only where necessary; evidence of original opening is maintained; where replacement is the only option, the new features will match the original
- (12) **Materials**
All construction materials are appropriate to the building and to the neighborhood
- (13) **Surface Textures**
Appropriate to historical style of existing structure; and may be differentiated at additions
- (14) **Colors**
Appropriate to architectural style of structure and historic period (may only be considered as part of a required HPZ review)
- (15) **Character-Defining Features**
 - (a) Alterations or changes to character-defining features are minimal; any historical and distinctive architectural details remain
 - (b) Distinctive materials, features, finishes and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship are preserved; No chemical or physical treatments that would cause damage to historic materials
 - (c) Most properties change over time; those changes that have acquired historic significance in their own right shall be retained and preserved
 - (d) Repair options fully explored before replacement is considered; where replacement is the only option, the new features will match the old; replacement of missing features substantiated by documentary and physical evidence
- (16) **Architectural Style**
Architectural style of alterations and new construction is compatible but differentiated from historic structure on site and surrounding properties, but there are no conjectural features or elements that give a "false sense of history" (Renovation to earlier historic style of property is acceptable if based on documentary evidence)

| | | | |
|-------------------------------------|--------------------------|--------------------------|---|
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | (17) <u>Details</u> New additions are appropriate to styles found within the HPZ, while avoiding a false sense of historical development such as by adding conjectural features from other buildings |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | (18) <u>Reversibility</u> New additions, if removed in the future, leave the essential form and integrity of the property and its environment unimpaired |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | (19) <u>Landscaping</u> Plantings and ornamental features reflect the historic period of subject structure (may only be considered as part of a required HPZ review) |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | (20) <u>Enclosures</u> Fences, walls, or other physical features are compatible with architectural style of subject structure and contributing properties within the development zone |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | (21) <u>Utilities</u> New above ground power and telephone lines and utility connections are appropriately located |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | (22) <u>Motor Vehicle & Parking Areas</u> (a) Off-site parking spaces for uses within HPZ are not more than 600 feet away (b) New and modified vehicular use areas are landscaped and screened using compatible structural and plant materials |

| New Construction & Non-Contributing Property Modifications (UDC 5.8, TSM 9-02.7.0, SOI Standards, HPZ Design Guidelines) | | | |
|---|-------------------------------------|--------------------------|---|
| S | D | NA | S - satisfies D - does not satisfy NA - not applicable |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | (1) <u>General</u> Compatible with contributing properties within the HPZ (new construction is not mistaken for an original historic building) |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | (2) <u>Height</u> Height generally conforms to typical height within development zone; new buildings are no higher than the tallest contributor of the same use in the development zone (e.g. principal buildings are compared to principal buildings, accessory structures are compared to accessory structures except for Accessory Dwelling Units, which are compared to primary buildings); and height of new buildings are compatible with the height of neighboring contributing historic properties. |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | (3) <u>Roof Types</u> Roof is compatible in configuration, mass, and materials to the prevailing style and period of existing structures within the development zone |
| <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | (4) <u>Setbacks</u> Maintains prevailing street and interior perimeter yard setbacks within its development zone |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | (5) <u>Site Utilization</u> |

- Spacing between building is consistent with that of contributors within the development zone
- (6) **Building Form**
Size, scale and mass of additions are compatible with contributors within the development zone
 - (7) **Proportion**
Consistent with prevailing proportions of contributing properties within the development zone
 - (8) **Projections and Recessions**
Consistent with prevailing projections and recessions of contributing properties within the development zone
 - (9) **Rhythm**
Proportion, patterns and rhythm of openings, including at any additions, are compatible with those of contributors within development zone
 - (10) **Windows & Doors**
The size, shape, and materials of window and door openings are compatible with those of contributors within the development zone
 - (11) **Materials**
All construction materials are appropriate to the HPZ
 - (12) **Surface Textures**
Appropriate to historical style of the HPZ
 - (13) **Colors**
Appropriate to the HPZ (May only be considered as part of a required HPZ review)
 - (14) **Architectural Style**
New construction is compatible with surrounding properties, but there are no conjectural features or "false sense of history"
 - (15) **Details**
New construction is appropriate to styles found within the HPZ, while avoiding a false sense of historical development such as by adding conjectural features from other buildings
 - (16) **Landscaping**
Plantings and ornamental features reflect the historic period of the HPZ (may only be considered as part of a required HPZ review)
 - (17) **Enclosures**
Fences, walls, or other physical features are compatible with architectural style of contributing properties within the development zone
 - (18) **Utilities**
New above ground power and telephone lines and utility connections are appropriate
 - (19) **Motor Vehicle & Parking Areas**
 - (a) Off-site parking spaces for uses within HPZ are not more than 600 feet away
 - (20) (b) New and modified vehicular use areas are landscaped and screened using compatible structural and plant materials

REQUESTED ACTION

The Department seeks reconsideration of the revised plans and recommendation whether to approve, approve of the conditions, or deny the proposed project.