



# FULL HISTORIC REVIEW

## EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

---

DATE: APRIL 23, 2026

**ACTIVITY NUMBER:** SD-0725-00102  
**RELATED ACTIVITY NUMBERS:** TC-RES-0325-01651/TC-RES-0425-01872/CE-VIO0325-01045  
**LOCATION:** 605 E 4TH ST/710 N 2ND AV (PARCEL #117033640)  
**ZONING:** HR-2  
**HISTORIC ZONE/DISTRICT:** WEST UNIVERSITY HPZ  
**APPLICANT:** ALEX ENOCH  
**PROJECT NAME:** ZONING VIOLATION/REHABILITATION/NEW ADU  
**STAFF CONTACT:** DESIREE ARANDA, HISTORIC PRESERVATION OFFICER

### PROPOSED PROJECT

The review is to comply with a Code Enforcement case at 605 E 4th St due to the installation of vinyl sliding windows that did not fit existing window openings. The applicant proposes to replace the vinyl sliding windows with aluminum clad wood windows, replace stairs at the back patio, repair stucco, and repaint the exterior of the existing home at 605 E 4th St. A new 45" wrought iron fence is proposed along a portion of the west property line. The project also includes demolition of an existing non-contributing garage and construction of a new one-story detached 787 sq. ft. Accessory Dwelling Unit (ADU) at the rear of the property (with an address of 710 N 2nd Ave). The proposed ADU would be lower in height than the main house and have a gable roof with red asphalt shingles, stucco cladding with sand finish in a tan color, a recessed entry with wood door featuring six-lites and two panels, and aluminum clad wood windows. The proposed ADU will require a setback waiver for a proposed setback of one ft. at the north property boundary (minimum 5 ft. setback is required per code).

### PROPERTY DESCRIPTION

The property is approximately 0.15 acres or 6,620 SF and contains a duplex with two addresses on same parcel. Built in 1917, it is a contributor to the West University Historic Preservation Zone (HPZ). The duplex is one of numerous bungalows in the area. It is a one-story brick building clad in stucco with a gable and hip roof, brown asphalt shingles, and four chimneys. The building has undergone various modifications and additions but still has sufficient integrity to convey its significance.

### APPLICABLE PRESERVATION STANDARDS

Pursuant to provisions of Section 5.8.9 of the City of Tucson Unified Development Code (UDC), the proposed project was reviewed for compliance with historic preservation standards by the Historic Preservation Office (CHPO). Applicable preservation standards include:

- Section 5.8 of the City of Tucson Unified Development Code (UDC)

- Technical Standards Manual Section 9-02
- The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation
- West University Historic Preservation Zone Design Guidelines

### **HISTORIC ZONE ADVISORY BOARD COMMENTS**

At the February 10, 2026 WUHZAB meeting, the board voted to continue the item to a future meeting to allow the applicant to return with window types that meet the West University Historic Preservation Zone Design Guidelines. WUHZAB also recommended approval of the demolition of the non-contributing metal garage. See attached Legal Action Report (LAR) for more information.

At the April 14, 2026 WUHZAB meeting, the board recommended approval with the following comments:

- Accept changes to contributing property as presented to include remediation of windows to single hung aluminum clad wood windows to fit original window openings, replacement of exterior wood stair with metal design as presented, and replacement of wood picket fence with wrought iron picket fence.
- Accept proposed ADU design as shown with the following conditions: remove foam pop-out feature along the bottom of the exterior walls and move the parking area to the east side of the property (alley access) by shifting the ADU to the west so that parking is not directly in front of the 2nd Ave front of the building
- Ask the city to request that Park Tucson allow for 2 more parking permits for the ADU on 2nd Ave
- Ask that the drawings also be updated to directly call out the setbacks in the development zone that justify the proposed setbacks for the ADU and that the package also include examples from the development zone to support the approach for the stud wall detail of the ADU shown on sheet A7.0 feature 1. The items in this part of the request will be verified via a minor review

### **PUBLIC/NEIGHBORHOOD INPUT**

The Department has not received any public comments regarding the proposed project.

### **ZONING & BUILDING CODE REQUIREMENTS**

This review applies only to the project's compliance with historic preservation standards. Compliance with all other applicable zoning and building code regulations is required to obtain a building permit. Changes made to the plan to achieve compliance with these other code requirements may require another review for compliance with historic preservation standards.

The proposed ADU will require setback waiver for the requested 1 ft. setback at the north property line (5 ft. setback is required per code).

### **STAFF FINDINGS**

#### **Proposed Alterations to Existing Contributing Duplex:**

Historic Preservation staff find that the proposed work for the existing duplex conforms with preservation standards.

- Windows will fit existing openings and be double-hung aluminum clad wood windows featuring a lite pattern similar to the original with multiple divided lights at the top half.
- Stucco repair, paint, and replacement rear steps will result in minimal exterior changes
- Proposed fence is compatible with HPZ and development zone

**Contributing Property Modifications & Additions  
 (UDC 5.8, TSM 9-02.7.0, SOI Standards, HPZ Design Guidelines)**

S	D	NA	
			S - satisfies    D - does not satisfy    NA - not applicable
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	(1) <b><u>Minimal Exterior Changes</u></b> Exterior alterations and changes are minimal; property to be used as it was historically or given new use that requires minimal change to distinctive materials, features, spaces, and spatial relationships
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	(2) <b><u>Visibility</u></b> Alterations or renovations visible from the street are minimal
<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	(3) <b><u>Height</u></b> Height generally conforms to typical height within development zone; new additions are no higher than the tallest contributor of the same use in the development zone (e.g. principal buildings are compared to principal buildings, accessory structures are compared to accessory structures except for Accessory Dwelling Units, which are compared to primary buildings); and height of new buildings are compatible with the height of neighboring contributing historic properties.
<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	(4) <b><u>Roof Types</u></b> New or replaced roof is compatible in configuration, mass, and materials to that of the existing structure
<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	(5) <b><u>Setbacks</u></b> Maintains prevailing street and interior perimeter yard setbacks within its development zone
<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	(6) <b><u>Site Utilization</u></b> Spacing between buildings is consistent with that of contributors within the development zone
<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	(7) <b><u>Building Form</u></b> Size, scale and mass of additions are compatible with existing structure and with contributors in development zone
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	(8) <b><u>Proportion</u></b> Changes are consistent with proportions of existing structure and with prevailing proportions of contributing properties within development zone
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	(9) <b><u>Projections and Recessions</u></b> Appropriate to the style of the existing structure
<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	(10) <b><u>Rhythm</u></b> Proportion, patterns and rhythm of openings, including at additions, are compatible with those of existing structure and those of contributors within development zone
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	(11) <b><u>Windows &amp; Doors</u></b> The size, shape, and materials of window and door openings are maintained; repair options fully explored before replacement is considered; removals/infills are limited to only where necessary; evidence of original opening is maintained; where replacement is the only option, the new features will match the original
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	(12) <b><u>Materials</u></b> All construction materials are appropriate to the building and to the neighborhood
<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	(13) <b><u>Surface Textures</u></b> Appropriate to historical style of existing structure; and may be differentiated at additions
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	(14) <b><u>Colors</u></b>

Appropriate to architectural style of structure and historic period (may only be considered as part of a required HPZ review)

- (15) **Character-Defining Features**
- (a) Alterations or changes to character-defining features are minimal; any historical and distinctive architectural details remain
  - (b) Distinctive materials, features, finishes and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship are preserved; No chemical or physical treatments that would cause damage to historic materials
  - (c) Most properties change over time; those changes that have acquired historic significance in their own right shall be retained and preserved
  - (d) Repair options fully explored before replacement is considered; where replacement is the only option, the new features will match the old; replacement of missing features substantiated by documentary and physical evidence
- (16) **Architectural Style**  
Architectural style of alterations and new construction is compatible but differentiated from historic structure on site and surrounding properties, but there are no conjectural features or elements that give a “false sense of history” (Renovation to earlier historic style of property is acceptable if based on documentary evidence)
- (17) **Details**  
New additions are appropriate to styles found within the HPZ, while avoiding a false sense of historical development such as by adding conjectural features from other buildings
- (18) **Reversibility**  
New additions, if removed in the future, leave the essential form and integrity of the property and its environment unimpaired
- (19) **Landscaping**  
Plantings and ornamental features reflect the historic period of subject structure (may only be considered as part of a required HPZ review)
- (20) **Enclosures**  
Fences, walls, or other physical features are compatible with architectural style of subject structure and contributing properties within the development zone
- (21) **Utilities**  
New above ground power and telephone lines and utility connections are appropriately located
- (22) **Motor Vehicle & Parking Areas**
- (a) Off-site parking spaces for uses within HPZ are not more than 600 feet away
  - (b) New and modified vehicular use areas are landscaped and screened using compatible structural and plant materials

**Proposed ADU:**

Historic Preservation staff find that the proposed work for the new ADU conforms with preservation standards.

**New Construction & Non-Contributing Property Modifications**

City of Tucson Planning and Development Services Department  
201 North Stone Avenue | P.O. Box 27210, Tucson, AZ 85726-7210  
Telephone: (520) 791-5550 | E-mail: PDSHistoric@tucsonaz.gov  
Website: www.tucsonaz.gov/PDSD

(UDC 5.8, TSM 9-02.7.0, SOI Standards, HPZ Design Guidelines)

S	D	NA	
			S - satisfies D - does not satisfy NA - not applicable
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	(1) <b>General</b> Compatible with contributing properties within the HPZ (new construction is not mistaken for an original historic building)
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	(2) <b>Height</b> Height generally conforms to typical height within development zone; new buildings are no higher than the tallest contributor of the same use in the development zone (e.g. principal buildings are compared to principal buildings, accessory structures are compared to accessory structures except for Accessory Dwelling Units, which are compared to primary buildings); and height of new buildings are compatible with the height of neighboring contributing historic properties.
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	(3) <b>Roof Types</b> Roof is compatible in configuration, mass, and materials to the prevailing style and period of existing structures within the development zone
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	(4) <b>Setbacks</b> Maintains prevailing street and interior perimeter yard setbacks within its development zone
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	(5) <b>Site Utilization</b> Spacing between building is consistent with that of contributors within the development zone
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	(6) <b>Building Form</b> Size, scale and mass of additions are compatible with contributors within the development zone
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	(7) <b>Proportion</b> Consistent with prevailing proportions of contributing properties within the development zone
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	(8) <b>Projections and Recessions</b> Consistent with prevailing projections and recessions of contributing properties within the development zone
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	(9) <b>Rhythm</b> Proportion, patterns and rhythm of openings, including at any additions, are compatible with those of contributors within development zone
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	(10) <b>Windows &amp; Doors</b> The size, shape, and materials of window and door openings are compatible with those of contributors within the development zone
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	(11) <b>Materials</b> All construction materials are appropriate to the HPZ
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	(12) <b>Surface Textures</b> Appropriate to historical style of the HPZ
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	(13) <b>Colors</b> Appropriate to the HPZ (May only be considered as part of a required HPZ review)
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	(14) <b>Architectural Style</b> New construction is compatible with surrounding properties, but there are no conjectural features or "false sense of history"
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	(15) <b>Details</b> New construction is appropriate to styles found within the HPZ, while avoiding a false sense of

historical development such as by adding conjectural features from other buildings

- (16) **Landscaping**  
Plantings and ornamental features reflect the historic period of the HPZ (may only be considered as part of a required HPZ review)
- (17) **Enclosures**  
Fences, walls, or other physical features are compatible with architectural style of contributing properties within the development zone
- (18) **Utilities**  
New above ground power and telephone lines and utility connections are appropriate
- (19) **Motor Vehicle & Parking Areas**
  - (a) Off-site parking spaces for uses within HPZ are not more than 600 feet away
- (20)
  - (b) New and modified vehicular use areas are landscaped and screened using compatible structural and plant materials

### REQUESTED ACTION

The Department seeks a recommendation whether to approve, approve of the conditions, or deny the proposed project.